

The Introductory Sentence in Literature Research Articles Published in High-Impact vs. Predatory Journals

Mohammad S. Alanazi*

Department of English Language & Literature, Imam Mohammad Ibn Saud Islamic University, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia

Muteb A. Alqarni

Department of English Language, King Khalid University, Abha, Saudi Arabia

Abstract—The current study discusses the stylistic properties of the introductory sentence with which scholars begin their introduction in the literature field. The study draws upon a dataset of 624 introductory sentences, half of which are collected from high-impact Web of Science indexed journals and the other half are drawn from presumably predatory journals. The study shows that the introductory sentence written by authors of high-impact journals is a work-based sentence with a high number of references whereas that composed by authors of presumably predatory journals is a reference-less author-based sentence. Although Swales (1990, 2004) argues that less experienced writers may begin their introductions with Move 2/3-type sentences, the study shows that there is no difference between the two sets of scholars in terms of the usage of Move 2/3. However, authors of high-impact journals tend to describe their study, state their purpose, indicate research gaps and raise questions in their Move-2/3 sentences whereas authors of presumably predatory journals prefer definitional clarifications the most. The study also reveals that the introductory sentence produced by authors of presumably predatory journals is shorter in word count, full of repetitions and grammatical/punctuation errors and sometimes presented as a full paragraph.

Index Terms—academic writing, cross-cultural communication, contrastive rhetoric, English

I. INTRODUCTION

In the past decades, a large number of studies have explored the rhetoric and stylistic features of different sections of research articles (RAs) written in different languages (e.g. Swales, 1990 for English; Fredrickson & Swales, 1994 for Swedish; Ahmed, 1997 for Malay; Zorzo, 2017 for Spanish among others)¹. In these works, every component of RAs is independently analyzed: introductions (e.g. Samraj, 2002), methodology (e.g. Brett, 1994), results (e.g. Lim, 2010), discussion (e.g. Yang & Allison, 2003) and conclusions (e.g. Stamatović & Vesna, 2015). These analyses show that the RA is an academic genre that follows rules and conventions.

For instance, Swales (1990, 2004) puts forward *Create A Research Space* (CARS) model which proposes that academics follow three moves (1, 2, 3) when they compose their RA introductions (for more discussion on CARS model, see section 3). According to CARS model, the academic author opens his/her introduction with Move 1, where he/she writes general topic sentences that make a review of the past literature and announce the importance of the paper to the field. The author then takes Move 2 and generates sentences that identify the research limitations in the previous literature. The final component of the introduction is constructed following Move 3, where the author produces sentences that describe their study, express their purpose, address their research questions, and/or outline the organization of their whole article. These three moves have been found common in the RA introductions in different fields such as EFL (Chu, 1966), computer sciences (Anthony, 1999), social sciences (Lewin et al., 2001), physical sciences (Gross et al., 2002) and biology (Samraj, 2002).

Contrary to the previous works which focus on the RA introduction as a whole, the current study takes a micro-view and investigates the rhetoric and stylistic properties of the introductory sentence (IS) that appears immediately below the heading 'introduction' in the literature RAs. Because the previous scholars had to analyze all the paragraphs within introductions, they encountered a tedious analytical task that confined them to small corpora. For instance, in dissertation or book-sized manuscripts, Swales (1981), Najjar (1990) and Jogthong (2001) only managed to analyze 48, 48 and 40 full introductions respectively. To overcome these limitations, our current study takes advantage of the short length of the IS and draws upon a larger dataset consisting of 624 ISs. Half (i.e. 312) of these ISs are composed by

* First and Corresponding Author: Mohammad S. Alanazi (Email: msalanzi@imamu.edu.sa). Second and Contributing Author: Muteb A. Alqarni (Email: motebalqarni@kku.edu.sa).

¹ The abbreviations used in this article are as follows: HIJ(s) = High-Impact Journal(s); IS(s): Introductory Sentence(s); PPJ(s) = Presumably Predatory Journal(s); RA(s) = Research Article(s); WOS = Web of Science.

professional scholars who publish their RAs in High-Impact Journals (HIJs) indexed in Web of Science (WOS), whereas the other half are drafted by scholars who publish their works in Presumably Predatory Journals (PPJs).

Given that “nearly all academic writers admit to having more difficulty with getting started on a piece of academic writing than they have with its continuation” (Swales, 1990, p. 137), the objective of this study is twofold: descriptive and pedagogical. On the descriptive part, the study aims to highlight the differences in the properties of the IS between two sets of scholars publishing in high-impact vs low-impact journals. On the pedagogical part, the study intends to instruct beginners about the art of IS writing in RAs, disclosing the features they should consider in their IS so that it becomes similar in quality to the one written by professional academics.

The remainder of the paper will be organized as follows. Section (II) will outline the methodology of the study and the definition of the IS, whereas section (III) will lay out the CARS model within which the analysis will be couched. The results of the study will be presented in section (IV) whereas the closing remarks will be given in section (V).

II. METHODOLOGY

To our ends, we downloaded random 624 English-written RAs published between 2010 and 2020 in the literature field. Half of these RAs (i.e. 312) are published in 3 PPJs. These 3 PPJs are *International Journal of Applied Linguistics and English Literature* (i.e. 110 RAs), *International Journal of English Language, Literature and Translation Studies* (i.e. 110 RAs), and *Journal of English Language and Literature* (i.e. 92 RAs). Although these 3 journals might not be predatory in essence, we simply consider them as such for being reported in the predatory journal list proposed by Prince Sultan University Research and Initiative Center (see <https://innovation.psu.edu.sa/ric-v1/predatory.php>).

The other half of RAs are gleaned from 3 HIJs which are indexed in WOS database and which are different in terms of 2020-2021 impact factor: *Journal of Literary Studies* (i.e. 110 RAs, impact factor: 0.132, Taylor & Francis), *Journal of Commonwealth Literature* (i.e. 110 RAs, impact factor: 0.190, SAGE), *Early American Literature* (i.e. 92 RAs, impact factor: 0.247, University of North Carolina Press).

Following the definition of a sentence proposed by www.oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com, we define the term “IS” in this study as a set of words (i) that expresses a statement or a question, (ii) that starts in uppercase and end with a period (.), a question mark (?) or an exclamation mark (!), and (iii) that appears immediately below the heading ‘Introduction’. Because some introductions begin with a subheading, the IS that appears below the subheading is the one collected.

III. CARS MODEL

In the early 1990s, Swales (1990) advances CARS model as an approach to capture the rhetoric and stylistic structure of RA introductions. According to CARS Model, authors follow three moves when they write their introductions: (i) *Establishing a territory* (Move 1), (ii) *Establishing a niche* (Move 2) and (iii) *Occupying the niche* (Move 3). When an author composes his/her introduction, he/she begins with Move 1 (i.e. Establishing a territory) generating sentences that (i) express central claims as in (1), present a general topic statement as in (2) and/or summarize the literature as in (3).

- (1) In the past years, there is a growing interest in ... (Central Claim)
- (2) Teachers should develop new relations with their students. (Topic statement)
- (3) Previous studies demonstrate that ... (Brie, 1988) (Literature review)

In 2004, however, Swales (2004, p. 230, Figure 7.4) revisited his model, removing the three steps given above from Move 1, arguing that there is only one step under Move 1: *Topic generalizations of increasing specificity*. This step involves obligatory citations as shown in (4).

- (4) In the past decades, researchers noticed ... (Brie, 1980) (Topic generalizations)

After Move 1, Swales (1990) argues that the author turns to Move 2 (i.e. Establishing a niche) and drafts sentences that (i) are *counter claims* addressing the limitations in the past works as in (5), (ii) *indicate research gaps* as in (6), (iii) *raise questions* as in (7) and/or (iv) *present statements that continue the tradition* by replicating previous works as in (8).

- (5) However, there are limitations in these studies... (Counter claim)
- (6) No work has assigned attention to... (Gap statement)
- (7) One question that needs to be raised is.... (Raised question)
- (8) In fact, these studies need to be reconsidered... (Continuing traditions)

Swale (2004), however, reduces all the above four steps of Move 2 into two steps: (i) *research gap statements* as in (6) above and (ii) *presenting positive justification* as in (9) below (cf. Samraj, 2002, p. 15). The latter means that the author justifies his/her work immediately after he/she indicates the research gap. These two steps, according to Swales (2004, p. 230), may contain ‘optional’ citations.

- (9) One reason to explore these facts is that ... (Presenting positive justification)

After Move 2, the author, according to Swales (1990), turns to Move 3 (i.e. Occupying the niche), presenting sentences that (i) *announce the purpose of the study* as in (10), (ii) *describe the study* as in (11), (iii) *discuss the findings* as in (12) and/or (iv) *present the structure of the article* as in (13).

- (10) The main objective of this article is to examine (Purpose of the study)
- (11) The current article investigates/explores (Description of the study)
- (12) The current findings demonstrate/show that ... (Presenting findings)

(13) The structure of the paper is as follows. Section I... (Structure of the paper)

Although Swales (2004) did not revise the steps given above for Move 3, he added some more. He argues that the author, at Move 3, may also compose statements that (v) *pose questions* as in (14), (vi) *present definitions* as in (15), (vii) *review methods* as in (16) and/or (viii) *state the importance of the research* as in (17). Swales (2004) points out that all Move-3 statements may contain ‘optional’ citations.

(14) One question that remains unaddressed is ... (Raised questions)

(15) The term ‘anthropology’ can be defined as (Definitional Statements)

(16) In summary, these methods involve (Summary of methods)

(17) The current study highlights the importance of (Value of the research)

In light of these moves, and given that Move 2 and 3 always follow Move 1, we predict that all the ISs in our corpus are of Move-1 type. This prediction is in line with Swales’ (1990) argument that rules out the possibility that RA introductions may begin with Move 2 or 3 sentences. If this unpredictable scenario takes place, Swales (1990) claims that the RAs may be grant-related or may be “associated with less experienced writers” (p. 165). In light of these conventions, we predict that authors who publish their RAs in PPJs are more likely to write their IS following Move 2/3.

IV. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

In section (A), we will explore the rhetoric features of the IS in both datasets in light of the CARS model. In section (B), we will present other stylistic differences that separate the two sets of ISs in both corpora further.

A. The Rhetorical Properties of the IS in HIJs and PPJs

Since Swales (2004) argues that citations are obligatory under Move 1, but optional under Move 2 and 3, let us start by exploring ISs that are referenced in both databases. We find that 113 (36%) ISs out of the whole HIJ corpus (i.e. 312 ISs) are referenced as shown in (18) and (19) whereas only 33 (11%) of the 312 ISs in the PPJ one are supported with citations. The majority (279, 89%) of the ISs in the PPJ dataset are not referenced as shown in (20) and (21).

(18) HIJ: Henry James, if Desmond MacCarthy is to be believed, could “stand a great deal of gold” (Edel 1985: 646); it would appear that he could stand a good quantity of brocade, as well.

(19) HIJ: Catherine Belsey states that “for psychoanalysis, dreams recall a desire that is present in the memory, whether or not it was ever realized” (2008: 97).

(20) PPJ: Courage makes a man different from the others.

(21) PPJ: The history of feminism in India is commonly divided into three phases.

It should also be noted that 48 of these 113 referenced ISs in the HIJ corpus include direct quotations as shown in (22) and (23) in comparison to only 13 quote-including cases from the 33 referenced ISs in the PPJ database, e.g. (24) and (25).

(22) HIJ: Early in Hannah Webster Foster’s 1797 novel *The Coquette*, the heroine, Eliza Wharton, writes to her friend Lucy Freeman that she wishes “for no other connection than that of friendship” (6).

(23) HIJ: Summing up the significance of *Hannah Webster Foster’s popular seduction novel The Coquette (1797)* in 2006, Laura Korobkin proclaimed: “What is at stake, finally, in fielding competing interpretations of *The Coquette*, is the meaning for Foster—and for us as well—of her central term, ‘freedom’” (99).

(24) PPJ: “The mind is its own place”, says John Milton, “and in itself can make a heaven of hell, a hell of heaven” (*Paradise Lost*, Book I, 255).

(25) PPJ: In the nineteenth-century Britain, the father’s role is best defined by Nelson, “authority, guidance and financial support.” (McKnight 2011, p.155)

Recall that the 113 HIJ ISs and the 33 PPJ ISs discussed above represent the number of referenced ISs. Given that the IS may contain more than one reference, we find that the number of references in the two corpora varies. In fact, we find 140 references in the HIJ corpus in comparison to 34 ones in the PPJ one. In other words, 93 ISs (82%) in the HIJ corpus consist of single citations, but 20 (18%) ISs thereof contain 2 references or more as in (26) and (27) below. As for the 33 referenced ISs in the PPJ corpus, they are all single-cited as in (24) and (25) above, with the exception of one IS that has two references as shown in (28).

(26) HIJ: This article urges us to draw on archival texts in order to augment the colonial library (see Desai, 2001; Mbembe 2002; Stoler 2009).

(27) HIJ: In recent years, there has been a steady stream of scholarly work on how media discourses on “oppressed” and “downtrodden” Muslim women have been mobilized as boundary markers between “us” and “them” in the global “War on Terror” and a convenient justification of its policies, both foreign and domestic (Abu-Lughod, 2013; Morey and Yaqin, 2011; Whitlock, 2010).

(28) PPJ: Myths, generally defined as a traditional story or legend, offering an explanation of religious or supernatural phenomena such as the gods, heroes, the many forces of nature (Current Literary terms 1979:190), are still widely interpreted in conflicting ways (Levi-Strauss 1963: 206-208): as collective dreams, as the outcome of a kind of aesthetic play, or a basis of ritual.

As far as the recency of references is concerned, and given that the collected RAs are published between 2010 and 2020, we find that 78 (56%) out of the 140 citations in the HIJ ISs are references dated from 2000 or above as shown in

(26) and (27) above, whereas only 10 (29%) out of the 34 references in the PPJ ISs are from 2000-above. In other words, most of the PPJ ISs (i.e. 24, 71%) are 1999 or below as shown in (28) above.

To summarize, the first distinction between the ISs in the two corpora follows from the fact that authors in HIJs reference one third (36%) of their 312 ISs: 20 (18%) of these referenced ISs contain two or more references, 48 (42%) are quoted, and half (56%) of these citations are dated from 2000 and above. By contrast, PPJ scholars reference only one tenth (i.e. 11%, 33) out of their 312 ISs, 4% (13) of which are direct quotes, with only one IS containing two references and with only 10 (29%) references are from 2000 or above.

(a). *Move 1-Type ISs in HIJs and PPJs*

As predicted by Swales' (1990, 2004) CARS model, the majority of the ISs in the two datasets represent Move 1: 273 (88%) ISs of the HIJ corpus and 269 (86%) ISs of the PPJ one are all Move-1 sentences as shown in (29) throughout (32). In other words, there is no difference between the two groups of authors in terms of their preference of Move 1 sentences.

(29) HIJ: Literary criticism may be nearing the most significant dispositional shift since the advent of New Historicism some thirty years ago.

(30) HIJ: Our field has always had a vexed relationship to aesthetics.

(31) PPJ: Fictional literature is often described as the most popular genre of social criticism.

(32) PPJ: Sometimes fiction can teach us truth that is seldom expressed with clarity in ordinary time.

While Swales (2004) argues that there is only one step under Move 1 which is 'topic generalization of increasing specificity', we find that these Move-1 sentences can take different insinuations in terms of stylistics. The first distinction between the two sets of authors follows from the fact that PPJ writers focus in their IS on providing information about the authors they are addressing their works (i.e. an author-based sentence) while the HIJ academics address both the authors as well as their works in the IS (i.e. a work-based sentence). For instance, 50 (19%) of the 269 Move-1 sentences in the PPJ corpus aim to familiarize the readership with a short introduction about the literary figure under study (i.e. novelist, poet, short story teller, playwright etc) as in (33) throughout (36).

(33) PPJ: Rasipuram Krishna Swami Narayan is a versatile writer and one of the foremost novelists of Indian Writing in English.

(34) PPJ: Manju Kapur is one of the most acclaimed women writers of the contemporary era in India.

(35) PPJ: Ngugi Wa Thiong'o is 20th Century Kenyan writer.

(36) PPJ: Dattani is a leading professional Indian playwright and for him theatre is an art.

Although one may argue that the PPJ authors do this because most of the literary figures they explore are from India and they are less known to the world, we find all these names in the above examples are known enough and listed with full information in Wikipedia pages. Moreover, PPJ authors follow the same practice even with eminent figures known in the literature field as shown in the ISs below.

(37) PPJ: Gabriel Garcia Marquez, born on 6th March 1928 in Aracataca, a small town in Northern Colombia, is one of the best-known writer of our time who has emerged from the Third World.

(38) PPJ: Gustave Flaubert was one of the most influential writers of the modern fiction.

(39) PPJ: John Barth is an eminent practitioner and theoretician of postmodern fiction.

(40) PPJ: Roland Barthes (1915-80) is considered one of the prominent French literary critics who is an emblem of the turning point from structuralism to poststructuralist.

In contrast, these brief introductions about authors are found only three times (1%) in the 273 Move-1 sentences in the HIJ dataset as shown in the cases below.

(41) HIJ: Betty Roland (1903–1996) is perhaps best known as a career dramatist for stage and radio in Australia and the United Kingdom.

(42) HIJ: In the early days Matar was regarded as a British Libyan or Anglo-Arab writer.

(43) HIJ: Juliana Spahr (1966-) was born in Chillicothe, Ohio, and currently resides in Berkeley, California.

In fact, HIJ scholars are concerned in their ISs about addressing and analyzing the literary works (i.e. work-based sentences). If they do so, they follow the works under study with dates of publications and bring up the names of the authors who published them as shown in the following examples, be they novels/novelists (77 times, 28%), poems/poets (12 times, 4%), essays/essayists (12, 4%), plays/playwrights (7, 3%), movies/producers (6, 2%) and short stories/short story tellers (2, 0.7%).

(44) HIJ, Novel: At a key moment in the middle of The Algerine Captive (1797), Royall Tyler sends his American narrator, Updike Underhill, to Africa aboard The Sympathy.

(45) HIJ, Poem: In this article, I consider two fairly recent English poems by Van Niekirk: "Mud school" (2013) and "Fallist art (in memory of Bongani Mayosi)" (2018).

(46) HIJ, Essay: In an essay titled "Reading The Satanic Verses", published in 1989, Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak cites Roland Barthes' well-known formulation "The birth of the reader must be at the cost of the death of the Author" (qtd. in Spivak, 1993: 217).

(47) HIJ, Play: Beasty Girl: The Secret Life of Errol Flynn, a one-woman show written by Australian playwright Scott Rankin, was performed by Paula Arundell when it was staged at Tasmania's Ten Days on the Island festival in April 2003.

- (48) HIJ, Movie: Whilst it is now an axiomatic fact that the real story that the screenplay of Le Carré's The Constant Gardener (2005) retells is about the actual events surrounding the unethical "travelling" of lethal drugs by a pharmaceutical company in Nigeria, allegory in this film makes us see the resultant deaths as part of continental genocide by the same clinical or allied means.
- (49) HIJ, Short story: It may seem unusual to revisit "The Hitchhiking Game", one of seven short stories which make up Laughable Loves, a largely unknown anthology by Milan Kundera, first published in Czech as Směšné Lasky (1968), and subsequently revised and translated² into various languages.

The above stylistic preference takes place in 116 (42%) out of the 273 Move-1 ISs in the HIJ corpus. In comparison, the same tendency appears only in 74 (28%) of the 269 Move-1 ISs as shown in the following examples, be they novels/novelists (31 times, 12%), poems/poets (23, 9%), plays/playwrights (18, 7%), and short stories/short story tellers (1, 0.3%) and movies/producers (1, 0.3%).

- (50) PPJ, Novel: In "The Pakistani Bride", Sidhwa pictures the lives of women who are the inhabitants of harsh mountainous region.
- (51) PPJ, Short story: A struggle for dominance is outlined in the first few paragraphs of Flannery O'Connor's "A Good Man Is Hard to Find" and to locate what, or whom, dominates the thematic mood of the text would give indication of a frame bordering the tale, a tendency hovering over it, or a subtext at its foundation.
- (52) PPJ, Play: With The Zoo Story, Albee is credited with changing the course of American Theatre History.
- (53) PPJ, Poem: "La Belle Dame sans Merci" is one of Keats's most superb and memorable poems.
- (54) PPJ, Movie: In an attempt to explore the issue of alternative sexuality, Deepa Mehta's film Fire becomes an artistic expression of objective violence and ethics of the Real.

Note from the examples above that, although PPJ authors follow the same practice, they do not supplement the works they are addressing with dates of publications, in comparison to the ISs written by HIJ authors, see e.g. (44) throughout (49). Another important remarks follows from the fact that novels are discussed by HIJ authors 77 times in comparison to only 31 times by PPJ ones, whereas poems and plays are analyzed by PPJ authors 23 and 18 times respectively in comparison to 12 and 7 times by HIJ ones. We assume that these preferences of genres may be attributed to the fact that PPJ authors prefer short texts (i.e poems/plays) for analysis whereas HIJ authors take the risk in exploring long texts such as novels.

Other works that HIJ authors also shed light upon are the critic theory books written by professional critics in the literature field. This tendency is manifested in 27 (10%) out of the 273 HIJ Move-1 sentences in (55) and (56) in comparison to only one case from the PPJ corpus in (57).

- (55) HIJ: A provocative difference one notices on the cover of the two editions of Henry Louis Gates's groundbreaking book The Signifying Monkey is the change in the subtitle from "A Theory of Afro-American Literary Criticism" to "A Theory of African American Literary Criticism," a change that the book helped to enact.
- (56) HIJ: While it has been twenty-three years since Paul Gilroy published The Black Atlantic: Modernity and Double Consciousness (1993), it remains a touchstone in studies of the African diaspora.
- (57) PHJ: In Islandology: Geography, Rhetoric, Politics (2014), Marc Shell cautions that geographic determinism is "intellectually questionable and politically dangerous" (239).

Another behavior attested among the HIJ authors is that they interact with the news stories and the media events published in magazines and newspapers in general. This behavior has been found 11 times (4%) in the HIJ corpus as shown in (58) and (59) with no occurrence in the PPJs.

- (58) HIJ: On 13 September 2001, two days after the attacks on the Twin Towers in New York, a group of British men desecrated a mosque in Exeter, England by dumping pigs' heads outside and smearing blood on the walls (Woolcock, 2002: n.p.).
- (59) HIJ: In the days, weeks, and months following the 7 July 2005 terror attacks on the London transport network — an event quickly cast as "London's 9/11" and conceived as all the more sinister following the revelation that the perpetrators were British — the media became saturated with images first of the wreckage and the victims, and subsequently of the bombers and their homes in the West Yorkshire city of Leeds and its suburb, Beeston.

Another distinctive property among HIJ authors is that they narrate their personal stories in 9 (3%) cases of their 273 Move-1 sentences as shown in (60) throughout (63), with no similar practice among the PPJ writers.

- (60) HIJ: As a PhD student studying early American literature and ecocriticism at the University of Arizona in the early 2000s, I had the good fortune to work as research assistant to Annette Kolodny for several years.
- (61) HIJ: On 4 July 2013, I attended a one-day, in-house conference hosted by the English Department of the University of Pretoria with the express purpose of interfacing with some African scholars in order to gain insights into prevailing attitudes to Conrad generally and to Heart of Darkness specifically.
- (62) HIJ: In 2011, in a graduate creative writing workshop, I wrote a sonnet in the voice of Madison Hemings, one of Sally Hemings's sons.
- (63) HIJ: I was in graduate school in 2003 when my adviser, Shelley Fisher Fishkin, told me to be on the lookout for a new book by Annette Kolodny that would shift our thinking about the origins of American literature and the ways in which we narrate "first contact" between indigenous peoples of the Americas and European outsiders.

Another characteristic among the HIJ authors is that they address the research landscape within which the authors' articles can be situated as shown in (64) and (65) from the HIJ corpus. This characteristic manifests itself in 25 (9%) of the Move-1 sentences in the HIJ corpus but only in 8 (3%) cases from the PPJ Move-1 sentences, e.g. (66) and (67).

(64) HIJ: In recent years, there has been a steady stream of scholarly work on how media discourses on “oppressed” and “downtrodden” Muslim women have been mobilized as boundary markers between “us” and “them” in the global “War on Terror” and a convenient justification of its policies, both foreign and domestic (Abu-Lughod, 2013; Morey & Yaqin, 2011; Whitlock, 2010).

(65) HIJ: The question of exhuming and reburying victims of political massacres is a thorny subject in post-conflict societies (Ferrandiz & Robben 2015; Robben 2015).

(66) PPJ: The last twenty years have been clearly marked by an explosion of work in literary and cultural theory, providing a strong basis for further research on the relationship between literature, language and education.

(67) PPJ: Today, literary-critical theory has become an essential component of literary studies.

The remaining Move 1-sentences in both groups can be classified as ‘general statements’. These general statements in the examples below are more common among the PPJ authors (i.e. 136 times, 50%) than their HIJ counterparts (i.e. 82 cases, 30%).

(68) PPJ: We hear the words ‘right’ and ‘wrong’ several times a day in our lives.

(69) PPJ: One point is crystal clear in life; life is not a bed of roses.

(70) PPJ: Gender in the contemporary epoch resonates as the most generic term.

(71) HIJ: Early American literature is as dry as it is dusty, arcane as it is archival.

(72) HIJ: Children are, for obvious reasons, generally ranked among society’s most vulnerable members.

(73) HIJ: The early national period of the United States was far from utopian.

In sum, and as far as Move 1 is concerned, PPJ authors tend to compose half of their ISs as very general statements than their HIJ counterparts. However, 19% of PPJ authors prefer to acquaint their readership with a short biography about the writers they intend to address their works in their ISs, producing author-centered sentences, and explore more short texts such as plays and poems. In contrast, 42% of HIJ authors tend to begin their introduction with more focus on the literary works they want to analyze, producing work-centered ISs, and shed more light on longer texts such as novels. When HIJ authors present work-based sentences, they add dates of publications to the works being addressed, in comparison to their PPJ fellows who neglect publication dates. As distinctive characteristics in the HIJ Move-1 ISs, HIJ authors tend to discuss theoretical critic books, personal narratives and news stories more than PPJ writers do.

(b). Move 2 & 3-Type ISs in HIJs and PPJs

Although Swales (1990, 2004) eliminates the possibility that introductions may begin with Move2/3 sentences, and if so, these introductions may be associated with less experienced writers, our data shows that both groups, PPJ and HIJ authors, equally make use of Move 2/3-type sentences. Unlike PPJ authors who do not show any usage of Move 2, HIJ academics present 4 of their 312 ISs as Move-2 sentences. As far as Move 3 is concerned, PPJ authors present 43 of their 312 ISs as Move-3 sentences (14%) whereas their HIJ counterparts do the same in 35 of their ISs (13%).

Starting with Move 2, and although Move 2 can be represented as (i) a research gap statement or (ii) a positive justification (see section III), our study finds that all the four Move-2 ISs from the HIJ corpus refer to research gaps as exemplified below.

(74) HIJ: Despite the continued proliferation of scholarship on Samuel Selvon’s body of work, there are still important aspects of his writing that remain unexamined.

(75) HIJ: When thinking about the place that small literatures such as the literature written in Afrikaans occupy ..., it is difficult not to be daunted by the smallness and marginality of this literature against the vast backdrop of the world.

(76) HIJ: Although many critical studies conducted more recently support arguments in favour of the merit of Emily Brontë’s *Wuthering Heights*, many critics still fail to fully acknowledge the representation and examination of core nineteenth-century issues in the narrative.

(77) HIJ: Despite the expansion or demolition of the canon, too much emphasis in survey courses is still placed on ... texts, a practice that has tended to exclude works written for the early American stage.

As far as Move 3 is concerned, we find, in both corpora, ISs that express: (i) study purpose, (ii) study description, (iii) questions and (iv) definitional clarifications. In contrast to one PPJ author who expresses the purpose of the study once in the whole PPJ corpus as in (78), HIJ authors do so three times as in (79) throughout (81).

(78) PPJ: The objective of this paper is to focus on the structurally defined roles of the marginalized people in India since time immemorial by making a literary analysis of few works by Indian authors redefining the role of karma in colonial society and gradually highlighting the nationalistic approach in India.

(79) HIJ: This article aims to contribute to a consideration of how global processes can provide us with a site of practices to critique the restraints of national identity politics.

(80) HIJ: This article has a dual purpose.

(81) HIJ: The purpose of this article is to examine my role as translator in navigating between the Scylla of faithfulness to a source culture and the Charybdis of the demand for conformity imposed by the target culture.

As for the description of the study (step 2), we find that HIJ authors describe their study 25 (71%) times of their 35 Move-3 sentences as in (82) and (83). The same step has been found 21 times (49%) of the 43 Move-3 statements composed by PPJ writers, e.g. (84) and (85).

(82) HIJ: This article looks at Zimbabwean whiteness in the context of loss, dispossession, victimisation and the need to belong.

(83) HIJ: This article will explore the links between fantasy writing and postmodernist revisionist historicism in the work of a relatively neglected contemporary Italian novelist, Michele Mari.

(84) PPJ: The present study attempts to shed light on the statements of two great authors and also to examine their beliefs and ideas in the light of Spivakian postcolonial feminism.

(85) PPJ: This article explores how Ngugi wa Thiong'o's postcolonial novel *Petals of Blood* addresses the Issues of struggle and socialism within the matrix of class.

Regarding raised questions, our study shows that HIJ authors pose questions 8 times (23%) as shown in (86) throughout (88) as opposed to three times (7%) by their PPJ counterparts.

(86) HIJ: What is the subject of aesthetics doing to early American literary studies?

(87) HIJ: What are the origins of the American novel?

(88) HIJ: How can we live?

(89) PPJ: What is the identity of Blacks in America?

(90) PPJ: Why do characters are not willing to remember the past?

(91) PPJ: Who's Afraid of Virginia Woolf?

For definitional clarifications, the scale is switched. PPJ authors seem to define terms in 23 (53%) of their 43 Move-3 ISs as in (92) and (93), in comparison to only six definitional cases (17%) by HIJ academics, e.g. (94) and (95).

(92) PPJ: In the nineteenth-century Britain, the father's role is best defined by Nelson, "authority, guidance and financial support." (McKnight 2011, p.155)

(93) PPJ: 'Diaspora' is a term derived from Greek word 'diaspeirein' which means 'to disperse' or 'to scatter' (OED).

(94) HIJ: The postmodern is an epoch that is characterised by uncertainty about any final truth claims and provides an array of choices between a polyphony of different voices.

(95) HIJ: Revisionism means we ask new questions of old texts, explore old texts in new ways, or recover texts that were unimportant to an old paradigm but have different significance under the new.

In short, the two corpora in our study do not support the predictions made by Swales (1990, 2004) that the initial positions in introductions should be reserved for Move-1 sentences. Although Swales (1990) argues that beginning an introduction with a Move-2/3 sentence "may be associated with less experienced writers" (p. 165), both groups of authors use either Move 2 or 3 in their ISs (PPJ: 14% vs. HIJ: 13%). In other words, the current study shows that starting RA introductions with Move-2/3 sentences does not bear on the professionalism of the authors, and the quality of the RAs.

However, it seems that HIJ authors prefer to indicate research gaps in their ISs (i.e. Move 2, 4 times) with no occurrence of the same move in PPJ corpus. They also seem to state their purpose of their research (9%), describe their study (71%) or raise questions (23%) more than their PPJ counterparts who prefer definitional clarifications the most (53%).

B. Other Stylistic and Textual Properties of the IS

In this section, we will separate the two sets of ISs further by exploring other distinctions such as the word count of the IS (section a), the frequency of the parts of speech in the IS (section b), the grammatical and punctuation errors in the IS (section c) and the presentation of the IS as a full paragraph (section d).

(a). The Word Count of the IS

Generally speaking, the total of words in the HIJ corpus (i.e. 9841 words) is bigger than that of the PPJ dataset (i.e. 7460), indicating that the ISs in the HIJ database are longer than those in the PPJ one. In fact, the mean of the IS word count in the HIJs is 31.5 words (with std deviation: 15.06916) in contrast to only 23.9 words (with std deviation: 12.70318) in the PPJ ISs. The shortest IS in both datasets, however, consists of three words as shown in (96) and (97). However, the longest ISs in HIJ and PPJ corpora are 87 and 104 word long respectively as shown in (98) and (99).

(96) HIJ: What is disability?

(97) PPJ: Literature mirrors life.

(98) HIJ: When one is asked what they know about South Sudan, one will certainly recall that, South Sudan is the perhaps the newest country on the African continent which has failed to put together a meaningful and effective administration and is embroiled in senseless ethnic war between government soldiers loyal to President Salva Kiir who hails from the largest ethnic group, the Dinka, and some rebel forces who are on the side of former vice president, Riek Machar, who is from the second largest ethnic group, the Nuer.

(99) PPJ: We live at a time when people around the world are urged by many varied forces to leave their homeland to start a living in a new region leaving most of their belongings behind; what does not remain in the mother land and immigrates along with them to the new land is the sense of belongingness to home which is attached to the soul of every migrant individual, a sense that is instigated mostly by the nostalgic memories of the people and

places who/that address those memories and intensify the desire for home, hence occupational, political or cultural issues, ethnic conflicts, sheer boredom, etc.

(b). *The Frequency of the Parts of Speech in the IS*

Using the website (<https://parts-of-speech.info/>) for word classification and the website (http://www.writewords.org.uk/word_count.asp) for word frequency, we find that both groups of authors do not differ in terms of their usage of parts of speech. However, it seems that PPJ writers use more verbs, adjectives, conjunctions and determiners whereas HIJ authors use more nouns and numbers (i.e. citations).

TABLE 1
THE FREQUENCY OF THE PARTS OF SPEECH IN THE IS IN PPJ AND HIJ DATASETS

	PPJ: 7460 WORDS	HIJs: 9841 WORDs
Verbs	976 (13%)	1209 (12%)
Nouns	2598 (35%)	3526 (36%)
Adjectives	829 (11%)	1015 (10%)
Adverbs	247 (3%)	339 (3%)
Preposition	1148 (15%)	1548 (15%)
Conjunctions	307 (4%)	330 (3%)
Determiners	951 (13%)	1163 (12%)
Pronouns	196 (3%)	309 (3%)
Numbers	174 (2%)	401 (5%)

Although both sets of scholars use adverbs at an equal frequency, PPJ writers tend to use more unique adverbs before verbs as illustrated in the examples below. This usage has been found four times in the PPJ corpus with no similar occurrence in the HIJ dataset.

(100) PPJ: Women and nature are indispensable parts of the works of Alice Walker and she has empathetically written about them.

(101) PPJ: Toni Morrison, a foremost contemporary novelist, narrates the African-American experience and commendably succeeds in creating a clear view on the 'penetrating view of black motherhood'.

(102) PPJ: The reports of slaves pristinely came into sight in the United States in 1703; however, those ...

(103) PPJ: Sashi Deshpande in her book 'That Long Silence' not only forthrightly articulates a thematic and technical maturity but also effectively communicates an intentionally apprehended Feminine Sensibility.

Moreover, PPJ writers are found to repeat their words in a redundant way 8 times as shown in the following examples, with no similar behavior from the HIJ authors.

(104) PPJ: Literature is the only branch of studies that can deal with any other branch of studies.

(105) PPJ: Thakazhi Sivasankara Pillai is a prolific writer and a fast writer.

(106) PPJ: World literature and world languages are something that concerns our spirit, it is not something meant for specialist, and it is something that affects our soul.

(107) PPJ: To choose, to choose freely, to choose willingly, to choose with absolute will, to choose with deliberation, to choose for immediate gratification, to choose for 'eternal validity' (Choice 831), to choose for one's own self, to choose for other than one's own self, to simultaneously choose for one's own self and others, to choose from choices made by others than one's own self and to choose not to choose at all are the choices offered to man since he is constantly confronted with the dilemma of being and non-being, and meaninglessness and meaningfulness.

As far as the most repeated key words in the IS in both groups, we find that PPJ authors prefer general words in their ISs such as *literature* (PPJ: 40 times, HIJ: 23), *Life/lives* (PPJ: 23, HIJ: 13), *writer(s)* (29, 19), *twentieth* (9, 5), *century/centuries* (30, 15), *human* (13, 7), *is* (162, 99) *born* (10, 1), *called* (9, 3), *defined* (7, 0), *considered* (6, 0). By contrast, HIJ authors tend to use more specific words that serve their research agenda such as *article* (HIJ: 27 vs. PPJ: 3), *published* (17, 11), *year(s)* (26, 10), *recent* (10 vs. 0), *study* (23, 12), *analysis* (10, 2), *now* (7, 3), *central* (5, 0), *main* (5, 1), *signifying* (6, 1), *entitled* (5, 0), *will* (10, 2), *argue* (4, 1), *suggest* (4, 1) among others.

Furthermore, PPJ writers tend to use very promotional words in their ISs such as *most* (24, 10), *especially* (5, 2), *many* (10, 7) whereas HIJ authors use more neutral words such as *may* (6, 1), *might*, (6, 1), and *generally* (4, 2). Due to the variance in the interest and the domain of the study, PPJ authors are found to use more words such as *women/woman* (41 vs. 13), *feminism* (5 vs. 1), *movement* (5 vs. 2), *India/Indian/Indians* (21 vs. 6), whereas HIJ use more words such as *Africa* (27 vs. 1), *African* (33, 8), *American* (25, 13), *British* (13, 8), *white* (12, 1), *global* (7, 1) etc.

(c). *Grammatical and Punctuation Errors in the IS*

Given that PPJs are more likely to receive low-quality RAs, we expect more grammatical and punctuation errors in the PPJ ISs. In fact, we find 7 grammatical mistakes in the PPJ database, with no errors in the HIJ corpus. Consider the grammatical errors below from the PPJ corpus.

(108) PPJ: Women right to celebrate their womanhood; they sing women's dream and speak their bodies.

(109) PPJ: The postmodern era and its immediate outcome in relativity of values has made contemporary critics such as Slavoj Žižek look at different aspects of such concepts as violence, both mentally and physically.

(110) PPJ: The treatment and role women the play as portrayed in *The Poor Christ of Bomba* (Beti & Moore, 1971) can be seen from twofold oppression, of the colonialism and native culture, as called by Gutierrez as “intolerable” (xxii).

(111) PPJ: Indian English Literary Studies and Indian Literature in Translation play a vital role to create a new awareness amongst the masses about the position of women.

We also find that PPJ authors use improper punctuation marks four times as shown in the following cases. No mistakes in punctuation marks are recorded in the HIJ database.

(112) PPJ: Manipulation is one of the notions that can be categorized in the class of discursive power abuse, it is one of the most important concepts that belongs to the field of Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA).

(113) PPJ: Meaning of “Meaning in life”, is not a logical Quote but When the topic of the meaning of life comes up, people often pose one of two questions: “So, what is the meaning of life?” and “What are you talking about?”.

(114) PPJ: August Wilson, one of the leading African-American playwrights spoke for the racially discriminated and socially abused Blacks through his plays.

(115) PPJ: As the title of this research indicates, it deals with two areas of study, the first is a critical analysis of the discourse of the *Invisible Man* novel and the second one examines this kind of analysis from the view point of Bakhtin.

In sum, and as expected from RAs being published in PPJs, our study finds that 11 (4%) of the 312 PPJ ISs violate grammatical and punctuation rules.

(d). *The Presentation of the IS as a Full Paragraph*

Although a paragraph is defined as a block of text that (i) contains a number of sentences and (ii) is separate from other paragraphs by a line, we find that four PPJ authors (1.2%) cannot distinguish sentences from paragraphs, presenting their IS as a full paragraph as shown in the following two examples. Examples (78) and (114) above are also presented as full paragraphs in the RAs collected from PPJs.

(116) PPJ: Nayantara Sahgal’s novels remind one of the Gandhian ideals, not merely because they were instrumental agents in restoring freedom to India, but because today their relevance is increasingly felt due to violence erupting everywhere.

(117) PPJ: Kachchh, a nondescript piece of real estate, is now famous for tourist spots and widely known for its wild asses, culture, arts and crafts, mud work, Kutchi dresses and brine-soaked badlands outside Gujarat.

In other words, after PPJ writers compose their IS, they move to the second line beginning a new paragraph, leaving a bad impression over their entire works from the very beginning.

V. CONCLUSION

The present study provides insightful suggestions to the authors who aim to publish in a WOS indexed journal. It demonstrates that HIJ professional academics generate an IS different from that written by less experienced PPJ authors. Taking the IS composed by HIJ authors as a representative, the findings show that professional literature academics make their IS fairly longer (i.e. 31 words as a mean). The IS written by professional writers contains references and it tends to be more work-based (i.e. focusing on the works under study) than being author-based (i.e. giving short introductions about literary writers). This IS composed by HIJ academics is also clear of typos, grammatical and punctuation mistakes neither is it presented as a full paragraph.

Our results also show that both groups of authors equally start with Move-1 sentences. While Swales (1990, 2004) suggests that introductions should not start Move 2/3 sentences, arguing that this may be related to less experienced writers, we find that parallel minorities of both groups still use Move 2/3 ISs, indicating that starting with Move 2/3 does not bear much on the quality of the paper or the professionalism of the authors.

In light of these suggestions on the craft of the IS, it should be noted that writing an impressive IS does not guarantee that the sentences to follow will be as perfect. However, we assume that starting with an impressive IS may help the authors in their prose and academic progression, and may but not necessarily persuade editor-in-chiefs and reviewers in HIJs to consider the author’s paper as a manuscript that should be given a chance to be read.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Mohammad S. Alanazi and Muteb A. Alqarni would like to express their gratitude to Imam Mohammad Ibn Saud Islamic University (Riyadh, Saudi Arabia) and King Khalid University (Abha, Saudi Arabia) for providing administrative and technical support to this research.

REFERENCES

- [1] Ahmad, U. (1997). Research article introductions in Malay: Rhetoric in an emerging research community. In A. Duszak (Ed.), *Culture and styles of academic discourse*, (pp. 273-303). Mouton de Gruyter.
- [2] Anthony, L. (1999). Writing research article introductions in software engineering: How accurate is the standard model? *IEEE Transactions of Professional Communication*, 42(1), 38–46.

- [3] Brett, P. (1994). A genre analysis of the Results section of sociology articles. *English for Specific Purposes*, 13(1), 47–60.
- [4] Chu, B. (1996). *Introductions in state-of-the-art, argumentative, and teaching tips TESL journal articles: Three possible sub-genres of introduction?* City University of Hong Kong.
- [5] Fredrickson, K., & Swales, J. (1994). Competition and discourse community: Introductions from Nysvenka Studier. In B. Gunnarsson, P. Linell, & B. Nordberg (Eds.), *Text and talk in professional contexts* (pp. 9-22). ASLA.
- [6] Gross, A., Harmon, J., & Reidy, M. (2002). *Communicating science: The scientific article from the 17th century to the present*. Oxford University Press.
- [7] Jogthong, C. (2001). *Research article introductions in Thai: Genre analysis of academic writing* [Unpublished doctoral dissertation]. West Virginia University.
- [8] Lewin, B., Fine, J., & Young, L. (2005). *Expository discourse: A genre-based approach to social science research texts*. Continuum.
- [9] Lim, J. (2010). Commenting on research results in applied linguistics and education: A comparative genre-based investigation. *Journal of English for Academic Purposes*, 9(4): 280–294.
- [10] Najjar, H. (1990). *Arabic as a research language: The case of the agricultural sciences* [Unpublished doctoral dissertation]. University of Michigan.
- [11] Samraj, B. (2002). Introductions in research articles: Variations across disciplines. *English for Specific Purposes*, 21(1): 1–18.
- [12] Stamatović, M., & Vesna, B. (2015). *The rhetorical structure of conclusions in linguistic academic articles published in national and international journals* [Unpublished manuscript]. Retrieved November 16, 2021, from: <https://bit.ly/3nko0jm>.
- [13] Swales, J. (1981). *Aspects of article introductions*. Aston University Press.
- [14] Swales, J. (1990). *Genre analysis: English in academic and research settings*. Cambridge University Press.
- [15] Swales, J. (2004). *Research genres: Exploration and application*. Cambridge University Press.
- [16] Taylor, G., & Chen, T. (1991). Linguistic, cultural, and subcultural issues in contrastive discourse analysis: Anglo-American and Chinese scientific texts. *Applied Linguistics*, 12(3), 319–336.
- [17] Zorzo, D., Ciglić, B., & Alonso, G. (2017). Intercultural rhetoric and academic writing: contrastive analysis of research articles' introductions written in Spanish by Slovene researchers. *Journal for Foreign Languages*, 9(1), 83–106.

Mohammad S. Alanazi is an assistant professor of translation studies at Imam Mohammad Ibn Saud Islamic University. He got his MA from University of Florida (syntax & morphology) and his PhD from Kent State University (translation and interpretation studies). He is currently serving as the Director General of King Abdullah Institute for Translation and Arabization.

Muteb A. Alqarni is an associate professor of Linguistics at King Khalid University, Abha, Saudi Arabia. He got his MA from Ball State University (phonetics & phonology) and his PhD from University of Florida (syntax and morphology). His research interests include syntax, morphology, sociolinguistics, discourse analysis, and pragmatics.